

Craigmillar Learning for Community Participation and Action report: Chapter 12 - Background information from the Craigmillar Learning for Community Action report (appendices)

Published by Craigmillar Capacity Building Project
63 Niddrie Mains Terrace, Edinburgh, EH16 4NX

Final version first published 2006

© Craigmillar Capacity Building Project

This report can be reproduced and copied but please acknowledge the Craigmillar Capacity Building Project when doing so; the only exceptions to this are the reproduction of text from the Craigmillar Community and the Estate of Bill Douglas where their copyright must be respected.

ISBN: 1-905851-13-8 (from Jan 2007: 978-1-905851-13-3)

Research team:

James Henderson – lead researcher

Paul Graham – research adviser

A 'research group' of local people - to locate key issues and concerns

Please note: the views of individual people, groups and organisations used within this report, and those of the lead researcher in expressing his interpretations and views in this report, cannot be assumed to be those of the Craigmillar Capacity Building Project.

Likewise, it should not be assumed that by contributing to the research any of the people or organisations who have done so, *necessarily agree* with the lead researcher's interpretations, views and conclusions, or the proposed outcomes and actions within a learning programme.



PROJECT PART-FINANCED
BY THE EUROPEAN UNION

Europe and Scotland
Making it **work together**



Final version of the Craigmillar Learning for Community Participation and Action report, Chapter 12, Jan 2006

Acknowledgements:

The Craigmillar Capacity Building Project and the lead researcher gratefully acknowledges the support of the many people, projects and organisations across Craigmillar and beyond who helped with this action research project.

A full list of those who wished to be acknowledged is found later in this chapter, 'Background information (appendices)'.

Thanks also to the following for allowing the use of text from one of their publications:

Craigmillar Communiversality (see chapters 7 and 9)
The Estate of Bill Douglas (see chapter 7)

Chapter 12: Background information from the Craigmillar Learning for Community Action report (appendices)

Introduction

This chapter of the report provides some background knowledge (or appendices) on the research process:

- full acknowledgements of individuals and organisations that supported the research – appendix 1;
- detail on initially understanding of ‘the pool of community knowledge’ - appendix 2;
- underlying values for the research – appendix 3;
- report feeding back the results of the consultation – appendix 4.

A copy of the draft initial research plan and draft scoping report are available from the Craigmillar Capacity Building project.

Appendix 1. Full acknowledgements:

The Craigmillar Capacity Building Project, and the lead researcher, **gratefully acknowledge** the support of the many people, projects and organisations across Craigmillar and beyond who've contributed to this action research project.

It should not be assumed however that by contributing to the research any of the people or organisations listed *necessarily agree* with the lead researcher's interpretations, views and conclusions, or the proposed outcomes and actions within a learning programme.

1a. People active in the community who shared information with the researcher about skills and knowledge for community participation and action¹ (79):

Gillian Armstrong, Carl Barber, Nikki Barnes, Elizabeth Baron, Michael Bridgman, Bob Cairns, Peter Calvey, Norma Chalmers, Val Coelho, Eddie Coyle, Helen Crummy, Jim Dalgety, Jo Dalrymple, Karen Davidson, Norrie Davies, Andy Dicks, Saly Eltereifi, Johann Ferguson, Karen Fraser, Paul Graham, Raymond Harland, Tam Heron, Janet Howie, Jean Hunter, Patsy King, Mark Laing, Stacey Marko, Bobby McEwan, Eric McEwan, Jamie McDougall, Brooke McGee, Eileen McMillan, Kate McNeill, Mick McNulty, John Mooney, Kara Mulvihill, Paul Nolan, Joseph Roberts, George Riddle, Garreth Roberts, Gail Ross, Val O'Rourke, Lynn Rush, Jean Sawyer, Hendry Scotland, George Selkirk, Mrs Singh, John Smith, Charlene Sohlberg, Valerie Stenhouse, Owen Thomas, Eric Thompson, Kate Towie, Isabel Trowell, Davie Walker, Karen Williamson, Ellen Wood.

Anonymous contributors:

11 adults living locally

11 young people from the Children Decide group (at the Venchie) and the Eco-committee (at Castlebrae Community High School).

1b. Local groups of volunteers and activists who contributed during main body of research (11):

Bingham 50+ Management Committee, Castlebrae Community High School Eco-Committee, Castlevie Parents Group, Children Decide Group (Venchie), Craigmillar Community Arts Board, Cragimillar Self-builders Housing Association, Democracy Disability and Society Group, Group of service-users from North East Edinburgh Support Services, Lismore Parents Action Group, Womanzone Cooking group

¹ Some of these people work for Community Organisations and Community Services in the area but shared information about their participation in the community as a volunteer, activist or member. They may have also contributed from the perspective of being a member of staff within a local organisation – see the relevant list.

Final version of the Craigmillar Learning for Community Participation and Action report, Chapter 12, Jan 2006

Also the 'Revoluting Youth Group' at the Jack Kane Centre who did not meet with the researcher, but who's report on their experiences of learning and training for community participation was valuable to this research.

2a. Organisations and their staff from within Greater Craigmillar who contributed to the main body of research (24 Orgs & 38 staff):

Adult Learning Link (Fiona Evans, Mark Robertson); Be Well (Sandra Williams); Bingham 50+ project (Catriona Kerr); Business in the Community (Jim Young); Caring in Craigmillar (Kelly Smart, Midge Lamb); Community Education/ CEC (Alli Abernethy, Derek Welsh); Craigmillar Ability Network (Terri Semple); Craigmillar Capacity Building Project (Mike Bell, Tam Heron, Cat Scott, Davie Walker); Craigmillar Community Arts (Mike Greenlaw, James McEvey, Becky Plunkett); Craigmillar Community Library (Paul Hudson); Craigmillar Credit Union (Margaret Evans); Craigmillar European Programme (Mack Wilkinson); Craigmillar Neighbourhood Alliance (Susan Carr); Craigmillar Partnership (SIP) support team (John Palmer, Graham Rowan, Clare Malster); Family Learning/CEC (Alli Donachie); Hunters Hall Coop (Scott Weatherstone); Instep (Natasha McInninie, Philip Hughes); North East Edinburgh Support Services/CEC (John Graham, Peter Forth); Jack Kane Centre/CEC (Scott Fraser); Jewel and Esk Valley College (Alex Galloway); Thistle Foundation (Raymond Harland); Womanzone (Michelle Corcoran, Lee McCormack); Worktrack (Evelyn Forbes); Venchie (Kristen Knudsen, Sheila Wagner).

2b. Staff working outside of Greater Craigmillar who contributed to the main body of research:

Richard Brunner- Atlas Partnership/Glasgow City Council
Helena Gillis – Equality Network
April-Wendy Hayes – Women onto Work
Alison Miller – Pilton Partnership
Isobel Pattie – Midlothian Council
Cathy Sharp – Research for Real
Jayne Stalker – East Lothian Council
Jude Wilson – Volunteer Centre Edinburgh

3. Groups that 'feedback' responses to the initial research findings included (10):

Be Well – a group of members
Castleview Parents Group
Community Regeneration Forum
Craigmillar Castle Regeneration Forum
Democracy and Disability Group
East Edinburgh Older People's Forum
Greendykes Neighbourhood Association

Final version of the Craigmillar Learning for Community Participation and Action report, Chapter 12, Jan 2006

Hunters Hall Management Committee
2 'ad hoc' groups – totalling 6 local people

4. Also particular thanks to the following local people who've participated in the main body of the research through 'the research group' and/or other involvements, and are now members of the Advisory Group for the project:

Norma Chalmers, Ibrahim Abdul Malik, Brooke McGee, Val O'Rourke, Owen Thomas

Appendix 2: An initial look (analysis) of the knowledge and skills within 12 key themes for community participation and action.

The initial thinking (analysis) by the researcher on what people had said during meetings, drew out these 12 broad themes into which a wide range of knowledge and skills that people have in this community can be put. This led to this draft outline of 'the pool of community knowledge' held within this community – which is described below.

These themes have then been explored in detail within the individual chapters in this report. Themes 1, 2 and 9 are found within chapter 2, and likewise themes 10 and 11 are found within chapter 9; the other themes have their own individual chapters.

A Draft outline of the 'pool of community knowledge and skills' - the raft of skills and knowledge that people across Craigmillar find useful from one-off individual participation at a meeting to complex organisational and leadership skills.

1. Finding out about community participation:

- Understanding the different things that people do e.g. on Boards, on Community Council, Youth clubs, driving minibus
- Understanding the different roles people play e.g. helper, organiser, representative
- How people support each other within communities e.g. advise each other, help with childcare
- Understanding what motivates people to be active in their communities, and what gets in the way of them being active
- Understanding which community services are working with your community and how they are working there
- How people communicate and learn from each other within communities e.g. using the Arts, networks of people, 'the grapevine'
- Understanding the full diversity of people within your community.

2. How community services and community organisations support community participation and action:

- What are your rights as a volunteer or community activists? E.g. Expenses, one-to-one support, childcare
- What training and learning can you get as a volunteer or community activist
- Exploring different types of support e.g. advice, opportunities to meet up and discuss?
- Who can help you set-up a community organisation?

- Who can help you set-up a community business?
- What sorts of funding are available to you?

3. Influencing decision-makers and local campaigning:

- Understanding who makes the decisions for what
- Understanding who can help you influence those decision-makers
- Finding out what others in the community are thinking
- Using the Web and email
- Using the local media, newsletters, video
- Using action-research, the arts and social events to increase participation
- Making connections with networks and organisations outside of Craigmillar
- Deciding if you want to take things further and who can help you e.g. forming a community organisation or group, finding relevant funding

4. Skills for working with people:

- Listening, confidentiality and boundaries
- working with or leading other volunteers
- handling difficult situations – e.g. anger, conflict, stress
- keeping yourself and others safe
- understanding that people and groups have different agendas
- finding a common cause or purpose
- leading a meeting or event e.g. being the chair, or organising a social event
- learning from mistakes
- learning about facilitation
- celebrating success and supporting each other in difficult times
- working with a diverse groups of people e.g. men and women, black and white, young and old
- alternatives to meeting – finding more enjoyable ways to work together
- working with child protection issues

5. Organising skills:

- organising and running a meeting e.g. committee or for members
- organising and running an event e.g. fundraising or training
- making your events and group accessible to more (all?) people
- working with and supporting other volunteers
- working with staff and managers– from your organisation or others
- safety issues – health and safety, insurance

6. People and groups developing their own (lifelong and community) learning:

- Different styles of learning – in groups, through the web, going out into the community, study visits, social events, the Arts
- Activeness in the community, good health, and ‘work-life’ balance.
- Understanding how you and your group fit within the community and the wider world
- Exploring opportunities for training and work within the voluntary sector, the social enterprise sector, and the broader economy
- Sharing learning and successes across the community and other networks – e.g. using the internet, film and video, giving presentations

7. Running community organisations and initiatives:

- legal responsibilities of Boards and Management Committees
- Visioning and action planning
- Good communication in meetings and between meetings
- Communicating with and consultation with members and the wider community
- Representing members and the wider community
- Learning to manage change
- Understanding different models of an organisation e.g. voluntary organisation model and social enterprise model
- Understanding diversity within the community and legal duties to include people e.g. disabled people and the Disability Discrimination Act
- Thinking about funding and finance-creating opportunities – public sector, grant-making, working with the private sector, trading in services
- Using Disclosure Scotland and thinking about child protection policies
- Practical considerations: health and safety, insurance, first aid, (food hygiene)
- Business planning – financial systems, marketing and communication.

8. Participation and partnership-working:

- what motivates people to join-in and participate
- meetings that are welcoming to people
- using action research, the arts and social events to promote dialogue and find common-cause
- how facilitators can, and can't, help.
- what is partnership-working
- practical ways of supporting partnership working
- thinking about how you can tell if a partnership is helping the community

- what are you're rights as someone from the community who is joining in with partnership and participation?
- participation and partnerships that lead into longer-term community-led projects, community enterprises and business
- Looking at examples in Craigmillar – e.g. self-builders, film-making, Wicked World tour
- Support available to develop longer-term projects take e.g. community services, council services and people who are already doing this in the community

9. Exploring diversity – both common bonds and differences - in the Community:

- The different areas/'villages' within 'Greater Craigmillar'
- Experiences of poverty and deprivation
- Disabled people experiences
- Women's and men's experiences
- Older people and younger people experiences
- Black and Ethnic minorities people experiences
- Gypsy Travellers experiences
- Understanding the law and discrimination e.g. Disability Discrimination Act

Not strongly represented within this report but crucial to diversity are the experiences of people from different faith/belief groups, and people with LGBT identities (Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual and Transgender).

10. Arts, Culture, and community regeneration:

- Understanding the work of Craigmillar Festival Society and its model of community regeneration
- Learning from examples of how the Arts can support local campaigning
- Learning from examples of how the Arts can support regeneration
- Learning from examples of how the Arts can support mutual support within the community
- Learning from examples of how the Arts can support planning – called cultural planning
- Looking at how the Arts can include and connect a diversity of people
- Arts on the web – supporting community communication

11. Regeneration in deprived communities:

- What is regeneration about?
- Understanding poverty and wealth
- Understanding the diversity of a community
- How poverty affects community health, mental health and drug-use

- Craigmillar Festival Society model of 'Arts and Regeneration'
- The Urban Design Framework
- Social Inclusion Partnerships – how are they helping?
- Community participation and consultation
- Housing Stock Transfer
- Anti-Social Behaviour, crime and including people (inclusion)
- Learning from environmental projects
- Regeneration and social enterprise
- Regeneration, the private sector, and 'the market'

12. Decision-making and power:

- Thinking about power – who has what and how they use it
- What does it mean to be representative and accountable
- What does it mean for the community to participate
- How the Community Council works
- How the Community Regeneration Forum works
- How the Social Inclusion Partnership and Community Planning Partnerships work ... including decisions about Community Regeneration Funding (was SIP funding)
- How the City Council works
- How the Scottish Parliament works
- The role 'the market' and private investment play in decision-making processes

Appendix 3: Underlying values used within the research

It is worth knowing about the perspectives that the researcher took in developing this research and in particular the 'values' that led the researcher to prioritise types of knowledge and skills. Key influences on the researcher's thinking include ideas on:

- **Participation, empowerment and cooperation;** knowledge and skills that increase the ability of groups and individuals to participate and work together²;
- **Community-led and developing community assets:** knowledge and skills that support community-led approaches which increase the asset base of the community³;
- **Equality, social justice, solidarity and human rights:** knowledge and skills that support people and communities in asserting their rights⁴;
- **Diversity, inclusion, respect and human rights:** knowledge and skills that support people and communities in valuing and respect, both, differences between people and common interest⁵;
- **Creativity and enterprise:** knowledge and skills that support people and communities in generating creative responses to situations⁶.

Given the broadness and looseness of these values, others aiming to use these values could still come up with different priorities and interpretations. There also are times when the values above can be in conflict with each other. There are different understandings of, for instance, human rights – some that emphasis individual rights and others that emphasis rights of groups and cultures.

² See for instance the work of Paulo Freire on community education and empowerment. One source of information on the internet is at: www.infed.org/thinkers/et-freir.htm

³ See John P. Kretzmann and John McKnight (1993) 'Building Communities from the Inside Out: a path toward finding and mobilizing a community's asset'. Go on the internet to: www.northwestern.edu/ipr/abcd.html

⁴ See Paulo Freire in notes above, and also the proposed Commission on Equality and Human Rights (CEHR). For more information go on the internet to: www.dti.gov.uk/access/equalitywhitepaper.pdf

⁵ For more information on inclusion and diversity try: www.inclusionscotland.org and/or www.shstrustorg.uk

⁶ For more information on creativity and community arts and culture go on the internet to: www.vascotland.org.uk/

For more information on social enterprise go on the internet to: <http://senscot.spl21.net/>

Final version of the Craigmillar Learning for Community Participation and Action report, Chapter 12, Jan 2006

More importantly, readers need to recognise the researcher is not approaching this research from a 'neutral' perspective, but from a perspective that aims to combine these values and thinking, and making judgements from that perspective.

Appendix 4: Feedback from consultation period on this 'Craigmillar Learning for Community Action report'.

Participants in the consultation

18 people requested 1 or more chapters; 5 people asked for a copy of the whole report. These included 7 people living locally and who are active in the community, 9 people who work for local organisations or services, and 2 workers from outside the area - one staff member from a voluntary organisation in Glasgow and another from the European Social Fund who are funding the project.

9 of these people offered feedback, some short and some lengthy. One of the contributors from outside the area gave extensive feedback on chapters 1, 8 and 10, and this is highlighted so that readers will know that it is coming from someone who doesn't know much about circumstances in Craigmillar, but who's comments can offer a fresh outside voice on the research and the area.

Please note: People and individuals who had taken part in the research had already had the chance to check and revise the ways their own contributions had been used in the report.

General comments made:

Several people felt that the report was easy to read and gave useful information:

Finding it interesting and informative

Easy to read for me. Lots of information ... Don't know if it would be of direct use to our work but yes if people are active in the community

Although the amount of information was potentially overwhelming:

(Can be) Overwhelming because there's so much ... A front page summary, (then they can read further) if want they want to know more. Don't want to bombard them with information.

One person warned that not all abbreviations were clear; for example, 'ACT' was mentioned in chapters 8 and 10 but it was not clear what this stood for. (Stands for A Consortium for Training – which provides community and youth work training).

A comment was made in the same vein about the use of the word 'members' – was this members of a management committee or people using the services of an organisation. A range of comments were made to improve the flow or simplify parts of the writing.

One person described various work undertaken by the Craigmillar Festival Society that could be highlighted or need further highlighting, in particular:

- A report by the Craigmillar Festival Society called the 'Gentle Giant who cares', which builds a Craigmillar Comprehensive Plan for Action – copies available from the Craigmillar Capacity Building Project library and through the Craigmillar Communiversity. This is a tool that could be updated and used to lead or inform regeneration in the area.
- The Blueprint for Craigmillar or a Vision for 21st Century Greater Craigmillar.
- An academic report done in 1985 on the Craigmillar Festival Society (CFS) and other organisations working in communities suffering poverty, was very supportive of the work of the CFS.
- Importance of the CFS model of "Arts; the catalyst. Education: the tool".

Final version of the Craigmillar Learning for Community Participation and Action report, Chapter 12, Jan 2006

Another worker in the area felt that it was good that the report recognised the political divide in the community that has developed from the present regeneration plans, the Craigmillar Urban Design Framework:

not just the CBP, (recognises) split in the community.'

And wanted to know more about:

Other areas, what are they doing? Like North Pilton

Researcher's response:

Using 'Plain English': we will be making sure abbreviations are understandable and that the text is as simplified as possible through strong proof-reading of the report.

Better information on the Craigmillar Festival Society (CFS): we will make sure reports and themes from the Craigmillar Festival Society are strongly flagged up within this report and within the learning programme – a significant number of local people and others from further a field are interested in learning from the work of the Society. I will include these reports in Chapter 9 on regeneration where there is a strong fit.

Use of summaries: We will produce a summary of the research findings will be produced, which will allow local people and workers to quickly understand the overall picture from the report. If times allows we will provide stronger summaries at the beginning of each chapter.

Report gives to much information: The research report is long and potentially overwhelming because the researcher met with so many people and wanted to do justice to what they say. The report is structured into chapters and sections so that you print off one or two pages of what interests you or the people you know. We will seek to make it more accessible by:

- producing an index making sure the introduction to each chapter makes it clear what is included.
- bringing it into the learning programme to be piloted in the first half of 2006; the trainers involved can help local people on the courses 'get at' what interests them.

The appraisal (learning and evaluation) of the piloting of these courses within the learning programme will help clarify if people on the courses have found this approach to the research report has made it easily accessible to them.

Looking outside the area: There is within the report a natural bias towards Craigmillar because the researcher met local active people from within this area, and wanted to do justice the knowledge and skills that are held locally.

Final version of the Craigmillar Learning for Community Participation and Action report, Chapter 12, Jan 2006

However, there are also mentions of research and views from outside the area within the 'researcher's comments'.

Again it will be important for the learning programme to support local people in finding out more about what is happening outside of the area through visits and use of the Internet. The appraisal of the courses within the learning programme will help clarify whether both the programme and the report can support people in finding out more about what's happening outside of the area as well as what is happening in Craigmillar itself.

Comments on Chapter 1: An Introduction

One local person from the area highlighted the importance of one part of the summary on Jane Thompson's thinking on lifelong learning and deprived neighbourhoods. This was the idea of the importance of 'a committed dialogue' between workers, services and residents – see page 10 of Chapter 1. They asked:

Is this emphasis the focus for this report?

Comments from one person outside the area raised the following issues:

- Chapter 1 is too long to read as an introduction to other chapters. There needs to be a much shorter, clearer introduction that people can turn to, which makes it clear what this report is about;
- The value of backing-up arguments with references to writers and thinkers such as Paulo Friere;
- The thinking of Jane Thompson – very important piece of thinking for people to be aware of;
- Develop the idea of a partnership between the community and services on 'our terms' – that is on the concerns of the whole community, using the community's strengths, and with the community in leadership roles;
- Keep the writing on the research in the present tense so that research feels active and present;
- Compare the diversity of people actually met with, with the statistics on the make-up of Craigmillar e.g. % of disabled people living in Craigmillar (see page 19 in Chapter 1);
- Comments on 'Community Divide' (pages 20/21) are 'hard to follow as an outsider –
- LGBT (Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual and Transgender) as a term 'needs plain English or it sounds defensive'.

Researcher's comments:

Committed dialogue: Certainly the underlying theme of the report is one of learning more about building a 'committed dialogue' about this community and its future – a dialogue that needs to involve the community, its leaders, and local organisations and community services. The fact that this resonates with the two people feeding back on this chapter above is very encouraging. I can strengthen this element through out the report by returning to it at the end of

Final version of the Craigmillar Learning for Community Participation and Action report, Chapter 12, Jan 2006

each chapter, and in the final chapter. More importantly, we can use this as a central plank of the proposed learning programme, and see if different parts of the report can support those who get involved in the learning programme in taking part in trying to build 'committed dialogues'.

Partnership on the community's terms: this is very closely related to the idea of 'committed dialogue' with or led by the community, and again is an underlying theme of the research report. We can strengthen this element throughout the report and within the learning programme by making it a central part of our understanding of 'committed dialogue'.

Using more references from writers/thinkers: it may be useful to do this in particular sections but I'm wary of including too many references as there are already a lot of footnotes and it makes the report feel more and more 'academic' rather than open to all-comers. Certainly will give a mention to Paulo Friere.

Chapter 1 is too long to be an introduction: This is surely the case for people who really just want to look at another chapter. A short 2-page version, 'Chapter 1a', can be produced as an introduction. The original Chapter 1 can be kept as 'Chapter 1b', which can be a deeper introduction to the research for those who are interested.

Keeping in the present tense: makes sense.

Diversity and statistics: useful comparison to make between the diversity of people met and the make-up of the area.

People outside Craigmillar understanding local issues: talking of the present 'Community Divide' within Craigmillar between the Community Council and the Community Regeneration Forum is local short-hand for a complex set of concerns about differences between them:

- their different approaches to regeneration of the area;
- offering different community leadership;
- largely made up of different networks of local people;
- connected with different community organisations and community services;
- different histories within the area
- different funding sources for local organisations and services, particularly through the Social Inclusion Partnership;
- open to different ideas, approaches and ideology;
- different relationships with City Council departments and City Councillors;
- different relationships with local political parties and local political leaders.

It is hard to do justice to this range of issues within the text so that people outside the area can grasp what is going on. However I will return to mention

Final version of the Craigmillar Learning for Community Participation and Action report, Chapter 12, Jan 2006

of this community divide within chapters 1, chapter 2, chapter 8, chapter 9, chapter 10 and chapter 11 – and look to make them clearer.

LGBT: I will adjust explanation of this term so that it is in at least in 'plainer English'

Final version of the Craigmillar Learning for Community Participation and Action report, Chapter 12, Jan 2006

Comments on Chapter 2: Understanding Community Participation in Craigmillar

One comment given on an additional example that could be used – a play produced by the Children Decide group at the Venchie – called ‘A kid’s life?’.

Researcher’s response: This is example is used in Chapter 9 and I will look at whether it fits better in Chapter 9 or Chapter 2 – and use a footnote to take readers to other relevant bits of the report.

Comments on Chapter 6b: Community Initiatives

One local person felt that it was very important to state clearly that community groups and initiatives need:

- Finances
- Flexible hours from development workers
- Decentralised computer networks, 'out to people' and 'outside of office hours' - palm pilots and phones
- Different types of access to resources that staff and others active in the community get.

Researcher's response: This was the intended message from Chapter 6b and I will look back at it to check that this comes across clearly.

Comments on Chapter 7: Lifelong learning and community participation

Comments from one worker at the European Social Fund (ESF) raised the following:

- That in this chapter, at least, that there is lack of input from people with disabilities and from people from BME communities (Black and Minority Ethnic communities).
- Is this report accessible to local people who are presently not involved in community participation? Or is it only open to people who are already confident and involved locally?
- Yes, lifelong learning can be stressful for people but can the proposed learning programme be flexible enough to successfully support people in taking part and 'alleviate' the stresses of 'learning'?
- The Chapter does fit with ESF's priorities for lifelong learning and helps to make the connection with community participation.

Researcher's response:

Disability and Ethnicity: Many people who are active in the community have disabilities. Across this research with local active people about a third of people who have taken part considered themselves to have a disability and the work of people with disabilities is particularly highlighted in chapters 2 and 5 as well as being raised in chapters 8, 9 and 10. What is perhaps missing in chapter 7 is specific mention of people with disabilities so that it is clear that the research has met with them. In fact two of the case studies involve people with disabilities who are active within the Craigmillar Ability Network, likewise another case study involves someone who has struggled with alcohol-use, although this might not be apparent. Information can be added to the case studies - in consultation with the people - that gives a clearer sense of people's identities.

The issue of race is much harder to work with because the research has not succeeded in making connections with large numbers of Black and Minority Ethnic (BME) individuals. The % of BME people in Craigmillar is small - about X%. The exception being Gypsy Travellers and other Travelling people's who are more numerous and make about X% of the population and who have had a long-standing impact on the culture of the area.

The researcher met with 5 Black people within the course of the research. Two who 'formally' took part and 3 who took part informally including one person who works for a City-wide organisation. There are a growing number of Black people moving into the area including refugees, and the Capacity Building Project, Adult Learning Link and Worktrack were three of the organisations who had made some links with people. Some Black people are

parts of extensive networks or communities across the City such as the Pakistan Society and a network of Sudanese people, and these give them strength and mutual support - this is highlighted in Chapter Two. Other Black people are already strongly involved in 'mainstream' community life and participation, particularly but not only, local shopkeepers. It will be one of the aims of the learning programme phase of this work to continue to make contact with local BME people and to see if the programme can be relevant to them, or to conclude that funding for a particular and distinctive piece of work will be needed.

Gypsy Travellers and other Travellers present a different challenge. They are present in very significant numbers yet local community services and community organisations seem to struggle to sustain contact with people outside of a very informal level - see Chapter 2. The researcher has during the course of the research met with one local person who has close links with Gypsy Travellers and talked with 3 different services who have some links. The work on the learning programme may allow an initial meeting through one worker who runs a local group with Gypsy Traveller women; this could allow, in a small way, initial discussion of what learning and support would be useful to local Gypsy Travellers and others, but again this could mean finding funding for a particular and distinctive piece of work.

Accessibility of the report: this has already been touched upon in the 'general comments' section. The report has been split into chapters and then into 'self-contained' sections so that people don't have to read the whole report or the whole chapter - but the bits that interest them.

The response from people in this consultation has been that it is readable and interesting in this form, but these people are people who are either already very active or who are local workers. Will it be accessible to a wider range of people who are perhaps less active and have less knowledge?

The best way to find out will be to use it within the learning programme and for the piloting of the learning programme to be 'diverse' and to explore as many avenues to meeting local people as is possible. Even if sections of the report prove popular with local active people, accessibility of them on the web is likely to need improving - through an index, and potentially highlighting of particular sections that seem particularly relevant to people.

Flexibly supported programme: an important issue that has been highlighted by the advisory group to the learning programme. The piloting work will allow the trainers, the researcher and the advisory group to explore a range of options for supporting the programme such as: childcare; transport; communication support e.g. induction loops, visual methods of recording; different venues; additional tutoring outside of sessions; adjusting individual course sessions to meet the needs of different groups and organisations.

Final version of the Craigmillar Learning for Community Participation and Action report, Chapter 12, Jan 2006

ESF's priorities for lifelong learning: the fact that there is a good fit with ESF priorities is encouraging. The challenge remains to use the piloting work to further establish a dialogue with local people about the value of lifelong learning, and more specifically about the types of lifelong learning that are likely to be of value to them in meeting their present priorities; and to anticipating a more equitable, just and positive future for the area.

Comments on Chapter 8: Participating in decision-making and partnership-working

A comment from a local active person on this chapter:

'Thanks a lot this is excellent stuff. I am fair chuffed – it will help a lot'

They were planning to use it within a report they were writing for a course at a local college.

Comments from a worker from outside the area:

- 'Using the arts' examples all come from young people – what about using these with others?
- Likewise, examples feel 'Youth heavy' – what about any other groups BME (Black and Minority Ethnic) and LGBT (Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual and Transgender) etc.
- Importance of developing 'skills to challenge power and take leadership – always underestimated I think'
- Likewise, the importance of local people recognising when services e.g. City Council departments, Health services, are open to working in a genuine partnership (dialogue, mutual leadership) and when they need to be challenged; 'Great - original idea!'
- "Representativeness and accountability are key concepts in participation and partnership. May be an opportunity to stimulate thinking about representing diversity? May be covered in other chapters though."
- "Good chapter, nicely research examples. I didn't feel a need to refer back to Chapter 1 at all. Intelligible without this but perhaps you need to remind people in the Final comment of how these questions 'knit' with concepts in Chapter 1"

Researcher's response:

Encouraging feedback from both people.

Key issues raised:

*Increasing the **power** of local people and the local community:* This is one area this research keeps coming back to and this resonates again with the work of Jane Thomson and her talk of 'committed dialogue' as noted earlier in looking at chapter one. This is a **crucial** key theme to emphasise in the final section of this chapter and also in the final chapter (11). It is also an area that requires more critical research to find out how receptive Local Authorities, Health Boards, Community Planning Partnerships, the Scottish Executive etc are to genuine dialogue with local people. When did they need to be

challenged by local communities and what are the effective ways of challenging them.

Increasing the range and diversity of examples: certainly there are limitations to the research. Using the arts with others apart from young people, work with Black people, and with LGBT people (Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual and Transgender) are largely missing from this chapter and the report. Finding examples has proved to be difficult, some of the reasons for this are explored in chapter 1 and chapter 11. The work on developing a learning programme in the second year of funding may allow opportunities to take this a little further – or it may require a more focused and separately funded pieces of work.

Representativeness, accountability and representing diversity: Again crucial ideas that are touched on in both this chapter and in chapter 10 which looks at the Community Council and Social Inclusion Partnership. These are issues that are relevant to all forms of representative democracy and to other forms of the 'legitimated' use of power such as 'markets'. The proposed learning programme can create opportunities for further discussions of these areas and how they can be taken forward locally. However to significantly take them forward would require significant investment in local structures such as the Community Council so that it is in position to develop further its ability to consult with the local community, actively involve a greater number of local people in its decision-making and to build local knowledge of the 'bigger picture' – the social and economic context within which Craigmillar finds itself.

'Representing diversity' is a particularly significant challenge at all levels of decision-making – that is making sure that groups of people with less power, e.g. working class people, people in poverty, black people, disabled people, women, LGBT people, and so easily lost amongst the 'noise' of more powerful groups, get heard and can make an impact on decisions. Again it needs both investment as well as commitment to in order to explore how to take this forward.

Comments on Chapter 10: Local decision-making and the wider world

Comment from one local person that they felt it was important to recognise the 'community divide', the different leadership that was being offered, and that they and others in their network felt that the leadership of the Community Council did not listen to their 'side' of the community, the Community Regeneration Forum. They were glad it was raised in chapter 10 wanted it to be clear.

Comments from one person, a worker outside of the area.:

- 'Further clarify the two models of 'political' and 'consensus building' in decision-making (page 4) by use of examples.'
- "Gold dust!" – comment on the importance of the respect when working in the Community Council.
- Democracy, Disability and Society Group – "Sounds amazing! Covered elsewhere in the report I hope!"
- "Wonder if these 2 'bigger picture' findings could 'head up' the Chapter; every examples of 'mapping' the strength and breadth of community experience. Then the question becomes how we learn from this, how is local life/ democracy different from the bigger picture? Just a thought"
- Quote from Dr Chik Collins on partnership-working and regeneration: "Need to link directly to Craigmillar experiences/ evidence you have found – otherwise it feels a bit theoretical not concrete enough to clinch the point"

Researcher's response:

Different models of working/ Community Council: will aim to clarify these two models further using examples. There is a definite tension that arises in political environments between *working respectfully*, and, *the deep conflicts and real heartfelt anger* that differences in views, interests and power can bring – the Community Council is not unusual in this respect. Clearly one person from one half 'the community divide' is very unhappy at not getting heard; others from both sides feel strongly that the other side cannot properly represent the community.

This leaves a key question then of what '*working respectfully*' in such an environment can and should mean? To successfully work with local people on both sides of the divide to disentangle the complexities of such a situation is beyond the scope of this piece of research, although it can be pursued further within the piloting of the learning programme. This would however be a valuable area for the Community Council, the Capacity Building Project and the wider community to explore further to see if 'common purpose' can be

Final version of the Craigmillar Learning for Community Participation and Action report, Chapter 12, Jan 2006

achieved on how the community council should work (its culture) and in what ways community leaders can work with diversity of people and views. This could result in greater clarity within the community about what is possible and realistic presently – particular in relation to funding.

I will adjust the first 3 sections of this chapter to make sure that it is clear that both sides of ‘the community divide’ feel their positions passionately, and that a learning programme can begin to get local people to discuss what ‘*working respectfully within a political environment*’ can mean. I will also be clear that this is problematic not just for community councils and communities but all democratic systems and political situations. It is part of a larger process of working out what democracy should mean.

Democracy, Disability and Society group’s work is raised in other chapters, in particular Chapter’s 2, 5 and 9; useful to get feedback from someone outside the area on how important their campaigning work is.

Changing chapter around so that leads with ‘bigger picture’ and moves onto ‘local democracy’: interesting thought because ‘the bigger picture’ is full of learning and insight. Can this knowledge bring insight into local issues? If there is time I will attempt this reversal of the chapter and see if it ‘throws-up’ a different insight ...

Quote on regeneration from Chik Collins: definitely in the wrong place, does not quite fit with the evidence being presented. But an important quote on the limitations of ‘partnership-working’, which would be better placed in chapter 9 (regeneration) within either the final conclusion or the section on ‘local views of regeneration’.

Comments on background information.

From one person outside the area:

- 12 key themes for community participation: needs an introduction; put themes in most accessible order – most complex last; simplify some of the titles; no 'faith' or LGBT in 'exploring diversity' section;
- Values of the research: why have these been chosen? And explain more clearly the tensions between different values.

Researcher's response:

Good points to raise – I will work with them, time allowing.