

## **Craigmillar Learning for Community Participation and Action report: Chapter 9 – Community Regeneration.**

Published by Craigmillar Capacity Building Project (CBP)  
63 Niddrie Mains Terrace, Edinburgh, EH16 4NX

Final version first published 2006

© Craigmillar Capacity Building Project

This report can be reproduced and copied but please acknowledge the Craigmillar Capacity Building Project when doing so; the only exceptions to this are the reproduction of text from the Craigmillar Community and the Estate of Bill Douglas where their copyright must be respected.

ISBN: 1-905851-10-3 (from Jan 2007: 978-1-905851-10-2)

### **Research team:**

James Henderson – lead researcher

Paul Graham – research adviser

A 'research group' of local people - to locate key issues and concerns

**Please note:** the views of individual people, groups and organisations used within this report, and those of the lead researcher in expressing his interpretations and views in this report, cannot be assumed to be those of the Craigmillar Capacity Building Project.

*Likewise*, it should not be assumed that by contributing to the research any of the people or organisations who have done so, *necessarily agree* with the lead researcher's interpretations, views and conclusions, or the proposed outcomes and actions within a learning programme.



PROJECT PART-FINANCED  
BY THE EUROPEAN UNION

Europe and Scotland  
Making it **work together**



Final version of the Craigmillar Learning for Community Participation and Action report, Chapter 9, Jan 2006

**Acknowledgements:**

The Craigmillar Capacity Building Project gratefully acknowledges the support of the many people, projects and organisations across Craigmillar and beyond who helped with this action research project.

A full list of those who wished to be acknowledged is found in the separate Chapter 12: 'Background information (appendices)'.

**Thanks also to the following for allowing the use of text from one of their publications:**

Craigmillar Communiversality (see chapters 7 and 9)  
The Estate of Bill Douglas (see chapter 7)

## Chapter 9: Community Regeneration

### Introduction

There has been ongoing work over a number of decades to develop and/or regenerate Craigmillar. These include investments and funding into:

- rebuilding housing
- community organisations, community support and community owned assets
- community facilities
- community services
- employment and economic development.

'Regeneration' is the present word used to describe this mix of processes. It is often seen as an initiative from national and local government; and is funded through UK Government and European Community funding, or more recently through borrowing by private companies from the banks.

But equally 'Regeneration' can or be seen as being about community participation, community-led initiatives and community campaigning. For instance, Helen Crummy's book 'Let the People Sing! A story of Craigmillar' recalls the rent protest of 1968 when council tenants in Edinburgh protested about rises in rent being brought in by the City Council<sup>1</sup>. This is just one of many possible examples of the Community working for its own development.

There are, then, at least two histories of regeneration in Craigmillar: one of government initiatives and another of community led initiatives. This chapter looks more closely at the work the community has or is undertaking to try and give direction to regeneration, in particular through:

- community arts, culture and creativity (pages 4–10)
- housing (pages 11-18)
- social enterprises (pages 19-22)
- health and well-being (pages 23-24)
- the impact of regeneration (pages 25-28)
- final comment on a learning programme for local active people (page 29).

**Note:** Before reading this chapter it would be useful to look at Chapter 1a. This will give you some background information on lifelong learning, community learning and development, and participatory research.

---

<sup>1</sup> See page 51 of Helen Crummy's book, first published in 1992, 'Let the people sing! A story of Craigmillar'. For copies contact the Craigmillar Communiversity ; contact details are on the internet at: [www.communiversity.org.uk](http://www.communiversity.org.uk)

## **Art and Culture: the 'Arts: the Catalyst' model**

You don't have to be in Craigmillar for long without hearing about the Craigmillar Festival Society and its work over several decades. Local people founded the Society to pursue community arts and other cultural and educational activities. This developed into an extensive community organisation working on a wide range of fronts to lead development in the area.

Helen Crummy, the first Organising Secretary of the Society, writes in 'A Vision for 21<sup>st</sup> Century Greater Craigmillar'<sup>2</sup>:

*'As all humankind is creative in one way or another, every generation comes with a rich mine of creative energy. Craigmillar, often seen as a most unlikely place, saw its people unleash this creative energy and employ it to bring about social caring, social action, and social change. While a sound dwelling, a safe and green environment, gainful employment and adequate transport can create a socially included lifestyle, for life to have purpose, meaning, challenge and self-fulfilment it needs a soul. Among other things this is met by arts, culture and education!'*

This is a powerful summary of the model, of the harnessing of creative energy and culture so that local people's concerns and energies direct community development. The extensive range of projects, campaigns, and acts of human kindness, described in Helen Crummy's book 'Let The People Sing!'<sup>3</sup>, make inspiring reading and demonstrate the crucial role that women and their families have to play in community regeneration. This is a complex story weaving together themes of culture, health, community leadership, community resourcefulness, democratic working and, of course, community regeneration.

The Craigmillar Communiversity<sup>4</sup> recently organised the 'Arts: the Catalyst' exhibition which explored a range of past artistic work coming out of Craigmillar – including painting, film, sculpture, song and drama – and their connections with community action. The accompanying documentary won the Saltire prize at the Edinburgh International Film festival (2005)<sup>5</sup>. The

---

<sup>2</sup> Many thanks to the Craigmillar Communiversity for allowing the reproduction of this text– copyright remains with the Craigmillar Communiversity. See the full article (p.79 -83) in Arts: the Catalyst – Craigmillar, published by the Craigmillar Communiversity Press. For information go on to the Internet at: [www.communiversity.org.uk](http://www.communiversity.org.uk)

<sup>3</sup> 'Let the People Sing' by Helen Crummy gives a detailed history of the Craigmillar Festival Society. Available from the Craigmillar Communiversity – for information go on the Internet at: [www.communiversity.org.uk](http://www.communiversity.org.uk)

<sup>4</sup> Craigmillar Communiversity has supported members in gaining a university education in Craigmillar or going to university. For more information on its work, the exhibition, the conference and accompanying film and exhibition guide, and its contact details go on the internet at: [www.communiversity.org.uk](http://www.communiversity.org.uk)

<sup>5</sup> 'Arts: The Catalyst, The Craigmillar Story' has won the 2005 Saltire Society short documentary competition at this year's Edinburgh International Film Festival. The film, which was directed by Simon Hynd and produced by Mickey MacPherson at Plum Films, was commissioned by Craigmillar

exhibition concluded with a conference, held in conjunction with Unltd Scotland<sup>6</sup>, which highlighted some present initiatives from different parts of the UK including:

- the Gothenburg – a community enterprise in Prestonpans
- ‘the Ultimate Chill’ – an arts festival for young people in Dundee
- canal boat/ canal regeneration at Ratho
- use of video to promote concerns of asylum-seekers
- an outdoor mobile cinema.

The Communiversity guide to the exhibition, ‘Arts: the catalyst – Craigmillar’ gives an in-depth account of difference aspects of this model, and how it has been used in Craigmillar and other parts of the country.

A key theme throughout the conference was that of the tension between ‘cultural democracy’ and ‘managerialism’<sup>7</sup>, and it was first raised by one speaker, David Harding, Head of Environmental Art and Sculpture at Glasgow School of Art from 1985 – 2001. Creative approaches to involving people in communities throw up challenges both to existing representative structures such as the Scottish Parliament or City Council, and organisational, managerial structures such as the Civil Service and City Council departments. There is a natural tension between the community and these structures that can be very tough to work with, but it is potentially very productive – and very democratic.

**Comment on learning:** The ‘Arts: the catalyst’ model developed by the Craigmillar Festival Society (CFS) highlights the importance of investing in the creativity of local people. Their energy and ideas can lead regeneration if decision and policy-makers can learn to listen. The challenge for those in leadership roles and for those working in services is to be open to such creative energies and to help them find direction.

The CFS published in 1978, ‘The gentle giant who shares and cares’<sup>8</sup>, which was Craigmillar’s comprehensive plan for action. It is an exciting and detailed example of how communities can plan for themselves and covers a wide range of themes – the arts, housing, planning, the environment, social

---

Communiversity and funded by Craigmillar Partnership and sales of publications from Craigmillar Communiversity Press. Copies available through the Communiversity. For contact details go on the Internet to: [www.communiversity.org.uk](http://www.communiversity.org.uk)

<sup>6</sup> Unltd Scotland supports community enterprise – see [www.scotlandunltd.com](http://www.scotlandunltd.com)

<sup>7</sup> See David Harding’s article (p.29-32) in Arts: the Catalyst – Craigmillar, published by the Craigmillar Communiversity Press. For contact details for the Communiversity go on the Internet at: [www.communiversity.org.uk](http://www.communiversity.org.uk)

<sup>8</sup> For a copy of the Craigmillar Festival Society’s ‘The Gentle Giant who shares and cares ...; Craigmillar’s Comprehensive Plan for Action’ contact the Craigmillar Communiversity – contact details are on the Internet at: [www.communiversity.org.uk](http://www.communiversity.org.uk). A copy is also held at the Craigmillar Capacity Building Project library for reference only. For contact details go on the Internet at: [www.craigmillarcapacitybuilding.org/](http://www.craigmillarcapacitybuilding.org/)

Final version of the Craigmillar Learning for Community Participation and Action report, Chapter 9, Jan 2006

welfare, education, and employment. It illustrates how complex community policy-making can result by working with the creativity of the community. It has lessons for present regeneration planning and planners as to how gain community support, and how to integrate a wide range of issues and concerns.

The challenge for a present day learning programme is to be open such creative energy and to offer tools that people can use to work with their creativity and gain confidence in using it. The CFS's slogan used to be 'art's the catalyst, education the tool' and this resonates with the experiences of many in this report. Clearly Craigmillar has a long history of, and great depth of, community action and learning that is invaluable for its present generations and for other communities in Scotland – and a learning programme must tap into this resource.

## **Art and Culture: community arts in action in Craigmillar**

There are many present and recent local examples within Craigmillar of community arts in action – here are a few:

### Music:

*In the summer of 1997 we did a drumming workshop with 60 young people during the holidays. This led onto the Jack Kane Hot Shots show and to 12 young people taking part in the Edinburgh Festival Jazz Parade ...*

*I also became Musical Director for the CFS 'In Your Dreams' musical. We included a man with learning difficulties through mime.*

*We made contact with the Triangle Group in Pilton, another music group, and this led to 'Giggers Gatherings' with people from Pilton and Oxfangs.*

*I started a music workshop with friend. I had a stroke so I had to take a backward step. I stepped back from the music workshop but it then fizzled out, so now I'm reviving it again<sup>9</sup>.*

### Community Arts:

*Through 'Arts the Catalyst' and the work of Steve Burgess<sup>10</sup>, I saw that 'people moving in the same direction get things done'. It was an ideology or theory for the Craigmillar Festival Society ... Arts as a catalyst can work. I've just taught myself this stuff (mosaic work) and people can learn it for themselves, they don't need me ...*

### Arts and Film:

*My filming projects include the Greendykes Tenants Association Mural. I was involved in filming the last week of creating the mural which was about Regeneration ... There was an official launch with Susan Deacon MSP. The film was watched at the launch by both kids and adults – both like watching it because it was about where they live.*

### Drama – for all ages (three different people's comments):

---

<sup>9</sup> Based at Craigmillar Community Arts. For contact details go on the internet at: <http://www.craigmillarcapacitybuilding.org/pdf/directory%202004.pdf>

<sup>10</sup> For more information on 'arts; the catalyst' and the work of Steve Burgess see 'Arts: the Catalyst – Craigmillar' published by the Craigmillar Communiversity Press: [www.communiversity.org.uk](http://www.communiversity.org.uk)

*I learnt from doing Grease. 200 people a night came<sup>11</sup>. They want to have fun and get away from their everyday lives. People fight every day, with the DSS, the Brew (Craigmillar Community Arts).*

*I started in a creative writing group and got asked to do a role in pantomime but wasn't comfortable so I moved to doing the lights. I've learnt through experience and have to be flexible (say with) jumps in the script.*

*We wrote a play, 'A kid's life', about the past, the present, the future. The past was down the coalmines and no rights for children. The present was about opportunities now, and the future was about making it a better place. We learnt from the drama teacher's skills: actions and expressions, dance, when to go (off-stage), and using loud voices. They helped us put the script together. We hand made invites and made school uniforms, rehearsed regularly as a group, bought masks, and made props. Craigmillar Community Arts made the scenery. (Children Decide Group at the Venchie)*

**Comment on learning:** A depth of knowledge and skills continues to exist within Craigmillar about using the arts, cultural and creativity, and connecting it to community concerns and needs. A learning programme for people active in the community needs to access this local knowledge and support people in developing the contacts that help them bring further creativity into their participation.

---

<sup>11</sup> Craigmillar Community Arts ran the show at Portobello Town Hall

### **Art and Culture: the frustrations and aspirations for the role of arts and culture within the community**

People who are active continue to learn and think about what can be achieved through arts and culture and there can be real frustrations:

*It (drama) needs people, money, resources. People like to watch it but there are fewer people taking part. For the first show I directed in Craigmillar, 50 people came along to the first meeting – it was a great show. Now ...*

*The politics of issues and filming them is very important. Derelict housing in Craigmillar is often used by TV cameras – an emphasis on the poverty in Craigmillar. It affects what people in Craigmillar and people outside Craigmillar think about it. For example, the emphasis on drugs, homelessness, crime, and sucking in cash – where's it (the cash) gone asks the media. It's a clichéd story – children walking passed derelict buildings, drug addicts.*

*In the 60s people were doing arts and that catalysed them. They put on shows, local political theatres and began to challenge the Council but then got large scale funding through the EEC and the Urban Programme ... and stopped challenging.*

But the same people develop their frustrations into aspiration, seeking to find constructive ways forward:

*I'm on Craigmillar Community Arts Board, which includes work on the new Arts and Business Centre, which will have a local theatre.*

*Using film for community drama, exploring issues and public consultations. Consultations using video to communicate facts and information from the community to the planners and back again. People could see all these things at home, or in projects or on the internet. This could grow into an archive for the community to reflect upon and re-use.*

*People power, the only way of saving the place; being cynical doesn't help, you have to do things and find positive ways.*

**Comment on learning:** There are both strong frustrations and clear aspirations for the role of arts and culture within Craigmillar and its regeneration and development. This is a time when 'Arts and Culture' is witnessing a revival internationally in its role within Community Regeneration, for instance:

- The Culture Commission has just completed its report<sup>12</sup> into supporting the development of arts and culture in Scotland
- Craigmillar Community Arts gave evidence to the Scottish Parliament's Enterprise and Culture committee during their own consultation into the role of the Arts in Community<sup>13</sup>
- The Scottish Arts and Culture Association<sup>14</sup> and the Scottish Urban Regeneration Forum<sup>15</sup> have both recently run conferences on the theme of 'cultural planning' and discussing how this can be brought into local and central government – in particular within community planning.

Within Craigmillar new opportunities are arising through the conversion of the old Craigmillar Primary School into a Business and Arts Centre. Castle Rock Edinvar Housing Association is the lead organisation in the redevelopment of the centre, and Craigmillar Community Arts one of the proposed tenants.

The Craigmillar Festival continues too, with a two week-run this summer – now in its 41<sup>st</sup> year (2005).

So there are opportunities opening up both locally and nationally.

One question that one local person raised was whether we can bring 'festival' into the centre of Craigmillar life – that is can we make creativity central to community life in Craigmillar? There is a difference between talking about it as policy makers and workers and how useful it can be, and local people actually discovering for themselves how useful it can be simply by doing it:

*The revolution will not be televised*

The challenge for any learning programme is in supporting people not simply in talking about it but trying it out, actually doing it.

---

<sup>12</sup> For details of the Culture Commission's work and final report go on the internet to: [www.culturalcommission.org.uk](http://www.culturalcommission.org.uk)

<sup>13</sup> For details of the Enterprise and Culture's report on arts and the community go on the internet to: [www.scottish.parliament.uk/business/committees/enterprise/reports-05/elr05-01-00.htm](http://www.scottish.parliament.uk/business/committees/enterprise/reports-05/elr05-01-00.htm)

<sup>14</sup> For details of the Scottish Arts and Culture Association go on the internet to: [www.artsandcommunities.org/](http://www.artsandcommunities.org/)

<sup>15</sup> For details of the Scottish Urban Regeneration Forum (SURF) go on the internet to: [www.scotregen.co.uk/](http://www.scotregen.co.uk/)

## **Housing – the Draft Urban Design Framework**

The Draft Urban Design Framework<sup>16</sup> produced on behalf of PARC (the Craigmillar Joint Venture Company) and then consultation on it in the first 3 months of 2005 has raised the profile of housing as an issue for the area. Different bodies and individuals within the area are working to understand and advocate the best approaches to take to housing. Below are two very brief summaries from the two local representative and consultative bodies, which give a flavour of their thinking.

### **The Craigmillar Community Council's response:**

The Community Council position statement<sup>17</sup> on the Craigmillar Urban Design Framework draws on the 'What do people of Craigmillar think about the Craigmillar Urban Design Framework?' participatory research report which involved talking with almost local 300 people. The report<sup>18</sup> was part of the consultation process and was produced by Scottish Participatory Initiatives<sup>19</sup> for the Community Council, the City of Edinburgh Council and the Craigmillar Joint Venture Company – see *Chapter 8 for details on how the research was carried out.*

The Craigmillar Community Council positional statement partly concludes that:

*'The framework is clearly driven by housing development. Whilst this in itself is no great surprise given the scale of the task of improving and replacing existing stock, and new housing is to be welcomed, it is apparent that economic considerations have dictated the development of the proposed designs/types/tenures/timescales. This is to the detriment of working to create a housing development programme which meets the needs and aspirations (and budgets) of local people.'*

### **The Community Regeneration Forum's response:**

---

<sup>16</sup> PARC (the Craigmillar Joint Venture Company) is a private company owned by the City Council and is charged with planning for housing and community development within the area. For further information go on the internet to: [www.edigroupscotland.co.uk/](http://www.edigroupscotland.co.uk/)

<sup>17</sup> Copies of the Community Council positional paper are available from the Craigmillar Capacity Building Project.

<sup>18</sup> The Final Report on the community consultation lead by Scottish Participatory Initiatives on the Draft Urban Development Framework is available from the Capacity Building Project website at: [www.craigmillarcommunitycouncil.org/UDFConsultationReport.doc](http://www.craigmillarcommunitycouncil.org/UDFConsultationReport.doc)

<sup>19</sup> For more information on Scottish Participatory Initiatives see <http://scottishparticipatoryinitiatives.co.uk/>

The Community Regeneration Forum (CRF) has also produced a report<sup>20</sup> in response to the Draft Urban Design Framework consultation. Twenty-two residents from every neighbourhood in Craigmillar met to discuss (critique) the Framework in detail – evaluating it on a page-by-page basis. Part of their general conclusion was:

*'The Community Regeneration Forum welcomes the regeneration of Craigmillar and is generally supportive of many of the strands included in the Craigmillar UDF. We think the mixed tenure approach to housing is essential to create a mixed and sustainable community, although the proposals for 'affordable' housing do not guarantee that this will remain affordable as the programme progresses. We would like to see opportunities for other models to deliver affordable housing.'*<sup>21</sup>

**Comment on learning:** Clearly both bodies are engaging with key issues in the Draft Urban Design Framework document and its impact on Craigmillar and its community over the next decades. There are local people and representatives here with knowledge that others active in the community can draw upon and learn from.

The two bodies and the leadership groups within both bodies have taken separate approaches and this demonstrates the present existing divide within the community between the two groups. These brief summaries can hardly do justice to the two reports but they do reflect, both, that there is common ground and common concern, but also that there is a difference in tone towards the framework. Here the Community Council are more sceptical and the Regeneration Forum more conciliatory.

For people who are active in the community there is a need to understand both the common ground and differences between the two bodies and their leadership:

- their visions of the future of Craigmillar;
- their functions – the two bodies play different roles within community life although 'Regeneration' is an important area for both to be involved in;
- their ways of working, networks of communication, their sources of funding and support.

Understanding these two 'community-wide' representative/consultative bodies is no easy task for people active in the community because this is 'community politics'. The relationship between the two of them is 'political', and therefore contested. There are not necessarily clear 'facts' that are agreed upon but

---

<sup>20</sup> The Full Community Regeneration Forum report in response to the Urban Design Framework is available from the Craigmillar Neighbourhood Alliance Project at the Hays Business Centre, Hay Avenue, Edinburgh, EH16 4AQ. Full contact details are available on the internet at: [www.craigmillarcapacitybuilding.org/pdf/directory%202004.pdf](http://www.craigmillarcapacitybuilding.org/pdf/directory%202004.pdf)

<sup>21</sup> From the Regeneration Forum News in Craigmillar Chronicle, June 2005

rather different interpretations, visions and versions. This is not unusual or special to Craigmillar - it is the way politics works at all levels.

People active in the community therefore need to understand 'the art of doing community politics' too and how to make sense of the bigger picture across the community – otherwise trying to work out what is happening becomes very confusing.

A learning programme should contribute to this learning, although there are potential difficulties, which need to be recognised and thought through. One is that the Craigmillar Capacity Building Project has the responsibility to develop this learning programme, and it also has the role of supporting the Community Council, so it is identified with one side of this divide.

Working to find ways to involve both sides of the present community divide in explaining their different perspectives could help local active people in understanding the differences of approach and in 'navigating' their way through the community's politics.

## **Housing – other local knowledge about housing (1)**

There are other local community organisations and groups who have valuable knowledge about regeneration, and who have or are seeking to take innovative approaches to housing. Here are two, but this is not a comprehensive list as there may well be others:

### **Bobby McEwan's history of the development of the Hunters Hall Housing Coop, reproduced by kind permission of Bobby McEwan and the Hunter's Hall Housing Coop newsletter 'Scoop'**<sup>22</sup>.

*I would like to pass on some history about Niddrie House and what Tenant's committees have achieved over the past sixteen years.*

*Prior to 1988 all the houses in the Niddrie House community were in need of major repair. The tenants approached the landlord (Edinburgh District Council) and were told that no funds were available. The tenants then began to look for another way to solve the problem: they were not prepared to continue living in cold, damp, rundown houses.*

*Later that year, one of the Tenants, Mr Eric McGovern, suggested that with professional help the people could set up a committee. This was successful and the turning point of Niddrie House. A two-year funding grant was provided by the council to employ three experienced staff.*

*After endless consultation the landlord agreed to upgrade some of the houses and put the rest of the properties up for sale. This still left the remaining Tenants with a problem. The discussions went on and on and as a result the Tenants came up with the idea to start a Housing Coop and call it Hunters Hall. This meant the Tenants would own their houses and be able to control how they were managed and could make sure the houses would never get so run down again. The Co-op received a grant from Scottish Homes to buy some property and then we borrowed another £1,000,000. The rent income allows us to pay back the loans and keep the houses safe, secure and well maintained: a good place to bring up our families.*

*Tenants' Committees made a difference and will continue to make a difference as long as local people continue to participate.*

---

<sup>22</sup> Hunters Hall is the housing cooperative for over 200 tenants at Niddrie House in Craigmillar. For contact details go on the internet to: [www.sfha.co.uk](http://www.sfha.co.uk) or [www.craigmillarcapacitybuilding.org/pdf/directory%202004.pdf](http://www.craigmillarcapacitybuilding.org/pdf/directory%202004.pdf)

## **Housing – other local knowledge about housing (2)**

### **Craigmillar Self-Builders group**

In 1998 Benarty Self-Builders came to a meeting, advertised in the community paper - the Capacity Building Project agreed to advertise a public meeting. Then we visited them and the Benarty people said, 'You must be in control and make decisions'. We learnt a lot from their mistakes.

We didn't want to go with a housing association. We wanted to remain independent so we wouldn't have our expectations changed, have them watered down. We're not expansionist, it's houses for active members only, and we promote self-build with local people. We are not a Registered Social Landlord<sup>23</sup>. It took us 3 months to register as a Friendly Society<sup>24</sup>. Community Self-Build Scotland lent us the money to register.

It's cheaper to build unhealthy housing but £70/80 grand mortgage is not affordable if you're single and on £10,000 per year, and renting is a gilded cage – there's no rights to the house.

We went to visit a site in Morpeth. Here a charity is regenerating a whole area bigger than Craigmillar. This includes houses in different styles: we went past a square-cut log house, and saw a curved window. Quality housing, this is the future. It costs 2-5 % more using sustainable materials but you get grants with energy efficient materials so it pays back immediately. We looked at compost toilets at Tribune Bay Wetlands

We decided we didn't want to dig foundations, the less training the better and the less time on site the better. We're going for factory housing meeting individual requirements.

The City Council gave us money to find an architect and we interviewed 3 architects, supported by Craigmillar Housing Development Project<sup>25</sup>. We found John Gilbert in Glasgow who has interest in social and eco housing.

A lot of us on the self build list live in Craigmillar and our homes are going to get knocked down, so need somewhere new to live. We want to build 21 houses and a community who know each other.

We identified a site in Niddrie Mill. It's 1.4 acres although we've been advised to go for 1.9 for parking and gardens. It's next to the burn so in extreme circumstances it would flood and so low economic value. We need access for

---

<sup>23</sup> A Housing Association would be an example of a Registered Social Landlord – an organisation that provides social housing but is not part of central or local government nor fully owned by the tenants themselves such as a Housing Coop.

<sup>24</sup> A Friendly Society is a cooperative form of ownership – for more information go on the internet to: <http://www.open.ac.uk/socialsciences/fsrg/>

<sup>25</sup> Craigmillar Housing Development Project – now the Craigmillar Neighbourhood Alliance.

Final version of the Craigmillar Learning for Community Participation and Action report, Chapter 9, Jan 2006

valuation survey but whole redevelopment framework process (Urban Development Framework) is holding us up – a survey can't happen until whole plan has been approved. We're willing to say houses can never be sold for profits and want to commit to 21 sustainable, affordable eco houses. Then we can begin to negotiate with the banks and City of Edinburgh Council Development.

## **Housing – comment on learning**

These outlines give a strong sense of the depth of local knowledge held within:

- Craigmillar Community Council – its members and associated organisations
- Craigmillar Regeneration Forum and its associated neighbourhood groups
- Hunters Hall Coop and its members
- The Craigmillar Self –Builders.

... and the depth of concern to 'get this right' for Craigmillar – to do the best for the local community.

This is not a comprehensive list; there are other obvious examples of local knowledge and experience:

- The community consultation report on the Draft Urban Design Framework led by Scottish Participatory Initiatives gives a range of ideas and concerns, from a wider body of local people, for how things can be significantly better. This includes local people who've lived in both council housing and housing association housing – the former often for many years.
- The neighbourhoods of Niddrie Marischal and Craigmillar Castle have experience of recent small scale housing stock transfers<sup>26</sup>
- Community people who sit on local housing association boards, who are active within their tenant participation programmes, or who work for local housing associations or the City Council housing department.

How can this range of knowledge and experience be used to benefit the whole community particularly when there are at least two large and controversial local housing and regeneration issues for the community and the City Council to work with? That is:

- The Urban Development Framework and then the plans for individual developments that would follow from it – for example within Niddrie Mains and Greendykes;

---

<sup>26</sup> Housing Stock Transfer is a process of passing ownership of rented housing stock from Councils to another owner usually a Housing Association or other Registered Social Landlord. Tenants vote on whether they agree with such a proposed change.

- The Edinburgh-wide Housing Stock transfer<sup>27</sup>.

The role of a learning programme should be then to support people in exploring the range of answers and working towards finding solutions that make sense to them.

---

<sup>27</sup> This would involve the transfer of all City Council housing to one City wide City of Edinburgh Housing Association. Council tenants will vote on this in. There are people and groups, for example those connected with the Shadow Board of the City Edinburgh Housing Association who support the process of Housing Stock Transfer, and groups who are campaigning against such as 'Defend Council Housing' and sees a different answer through a '4<sup>th</sup> option' in which national government finds other ways to open up funding for local councils –this is presently limited by UK Treasury rules. (Note, the vote held in Nov/ Dec 05 went against the Stock Transfer for the City of Edinburgh)

## **Social and community enterprises – participation leading to regeneration**

Several people had or were developing their voluntary work into a community enterprise or business with strong community roots:

One of the local film makers said:

*I wouldn't say I was a community activist. I've been volunteering to help a cause but this also helps me personally- getting a job, developing a business.*

One person has built up their business in disability awareness and equality training, disability and social auditing, and evaluation – starting from their own experience as a disabled person:

*I set up Ideal Training (Inclusive, Disability, Equality, Awareness, Learning). All housing associations were wanting disability awareness training ... I've done evaluations for C-Change, Partners for Inclusion and Inclusion Glasgow<sup>28</sup>. I take a holistic approach looking at the full picture and involving people using the service, doctors, families, staff ... There's an example (community enterprise) in Middlesex where people are earning £18-24,000 ... enough for people with disabilities who have additional expenses to meet to take up work.*

Another person was looking to set a business and looking for support:

*How? Where do I access information? Cre8te<sup>29</sup>? Capacity Building Project? I'm trying to find premises*

Both the Hunters Hall Coop and the Craigmillar Self-builders group are other examples of local people using their time to set-up their own local community enterprise.

**Comment on learning:** A learning programme can demonstrate that through community participation, and developing your skills and knowledge, some active people are looking to develop social enterprises and self-employment. The programme can highlight this as one way of developing your community participation and link local people who are interested in exploring this option with those who already have experience and knowledge.

---

<sup>28</sup> Organisations providing person-centred support to people with disabilities living in the community.

<sup>29</sup> Cre8te is the one stop shop in the area for advice on business matters. For more information go on the internet to: [www.cre8te.org.uk/](http://www.cre8te.org.uk/)

### **Social enterprises and community enterprise – new opportunities?**

Two people saw real opportunities in the development of the community and social economy. One saw opportunities in environmental and sustainable work:

*Scotland has an appalling environmental record but there are funds available for projects from the Scottish Executive and the Energy Saving Trust. Many projects are starting up but not here<sup>30</sup>.*

*One possible project would be collecting and renovating furniture, bicycles, stuff that doesn't work. You could bring in people with handyman or electrician skills and make links with the schools.*

Another saw the need to use 'the market' to create a success community economy:

*There's a fixation with 'economies of scale' but this is not sustainable and this is slowing down regeneration in Scotland. Communities Scotland talk of 'avoiding the market' but the market produces something for everybody – let everybody have quality.*

They had a vision of people in Craigmillar actively involved in regeneration through community economic development:

*There are those who want to stop it (the Urban Development Framework) and those who want it to go ahead. If tenant groups want facilities then they could work with development workers on a budget for what is needed, rather than starting out with a budget and dividing the thing up.*

*Why stick to the usual sources? Why not say, 'No, we need this, what are the costs? Where can we get the money?' Rather than, 'Let's bash the community into accepting this, everyone's had their cut.' ... With true community involvement, once people have responsibility for costs, costs come down.*

**Comment on learning:** Some people in the community are approaching regeneration from an economic perspective and asking how community enterprises and social enterprises can contribute or even lead the way forward for Craigmillar.

One local member of staff spoke passionately for the social economy:

---

<sup>30</sup> There are in fact examples of community recycling in Craigmillar which include the recycling of computers, and also more generally of environmental work such as Castlebrae Community High School's 'Eco Committee'

*There is a cultural shift from low key, lightweight voluntarism to raising awareness of the need to be business-like and sustainable. There needs to be a 'mixed economy':*

- *Grant aided through the Community Regeneration Fund<sup>31</sup> to develop partnerships and pump-prime.*
- *'Private sector' income streams such as contracting, membership monies.*

*One example is Craigmillar Childcare Services, which started small, but is now a £1million organisation using ERDF/ESF<sup>32</sup>, New Deal grants, and the private sector – fees and contracts.*

Another local member of staff was considerably more sceptical of the value of a market approach to ending poverty. They are critical of Labour Government policy that is:

*"Ignoring seventeen years of spiralling inequalities under their predecessors, they have maintained the belief that poverty does not result from the inadequacies of the market, but, instead is a result of the unemployability of the poor ...*

*... The notion of paid work as the route to equality rests upon two clear premises: the first concerns the ability of the free market to produce economic growth and sustain job creation; the second relates to the willingness of employers to ensure employment opportunities provide adequate remuneration to raise standards of living."<sup>33</sup>*

A learning programme could get local active people thinking about these sorts of issues: what 'markets' can and can't do – in what situations they can help, what are their limitations and what are their dangers.

And likewise looking wider afield for inspiration and alternatives; for instance, to what extent could a *small community* like Craigmillar learn from an economic strategy like the cooperatives developed in Mondragon<sup>34</sup> in the Basque *region* in Spain. Here a network of cooperatives was developed from the grassroots and now forms a major company that still runs as a group of cooperatives. It works within the market but with other social priorities too; so for instance, investing 10% of the profits into social projects – 39 million euro in 2003. Could community enterprise build the strength of this community? What would be needed for this to happen? Perhaps a regional approach or

<sup>31</sup> The Scottish Executive has replaced the Social Inclusion Partnership Fund as of April 2005 with Community Regeneration Fund.

<sup>32</sup> ERDF is European Regional Development Fund and ESF is European Social Fund.

<sup>33</sup> From a draft article – contact the Craigmillar Capacity Building Project for more details.

<sup>34</sup> For more information on the Mondragon cooperative movement go on the internet to: [www.mcc.coop/](http://www.mcc.coop/)

Final version of the Craigmillar Learning for Community Participation and Action report, Chapter 9, Jan 2006

an approach across communities struggling with poverty would be needed?

### **Health and well-being – another perspective on regeneration:**

There is a wide variety of community health work going on in the area<sup>35</sup>. Here are some examples:

- Womanzone provide a wide range of health-related support and training for women in the area – for example: counselling, food coop, drama – for confidence building.
- Be Well provide a wide range of groups and individual support – for example: counselling, alternative therapies, stress management.
- Heart to Heart group – local group that provides information, advice and support.
- Men's Health Group.
- Richmond Church Food Coop.
- Bingham 50+ does community health work with older people including information, health(y) activities and community safety.
- East Edinburgh Older People's forum provides information and supports people in receiving services.
- Lismore Parents Action group – a food coop and exercise classes
- Adult Learning Link run an accredited 'Feel Well, Eat Well' course.

This is not a comprehensive list but at least one local person is making the links between the inter-linking nature of health projects:

*There's a food coop at Richmond Church. Diet (and recipe) sheets at Be Well as well as counselling, alternative therapies and acupuncture. A new health centre at Craigmillar and Lunch Clubs for older people provide health food. Exercise at the Thistle Foundation. There's a Well Woman Clinic. Each compliments the other.*

And also making the connection between health, education and community regeneration:

*I don't believe there's such a thing as a deprived area in Britain but I believe in an educational gap. There's plenty of information from radio and TV. It's not a monetary problem but can be about time and education. We don't teach health promotion – it's not on the national curriculum.*

Another person, too, saw the importance of good health and healthy communities to children and families:

*The Club provides cold sandwiches for free, fruit for 10p, also hot dogs and toasted sandwiches ... it's important to see the real picture of what's going on, more drugs in the community, children needing more food, and parents needing support as well*

---

<sup>35</sup> For contact details for these projects go on the internet to: [www.craigmillarcapacitybuilding.org/pdf/directory%202004.pdf](http://www.craigmillarcapacitybuilding.org/pdf/directory%202004.pdf) or [www.be-well.org.uk/](http://www.be-well.org.uk/) or [www.adultlearninglink.edin.org/](http://www.adultlearninglink.edin.org/)

One person made the link between that poor housing and family health:

*Scotland has big health problems and 50% of health problems are caused by housing – damp, heating system, doors are not healthy.*

Another active person spoke of the wide range of approaches that the Men's Group at Be Well took to health; this included physical exercise and sport, using the arts, leisure activities, learning about health issues and exploring opportunities for further learning.

The Democracy Disability and Society Group<sup>36</sup> were concerned too for human rights within health services. Many disabled people don't get their right to information as citizens honoured:

*In the medical model, professionals have all the 'knowledge'. Disabled people become 2<sup>nd</sup> or 3<sup>rd</sup> party. In the social model – disabled people are citizens with rights to have knowledge and rights to access knowledge.*

**Comment on learning:** Thinking about health, well being and inequalities in health between different communities is a powerful way of highlighting what poverty means for people and communities. It highlights the link between housing and poor physical and mental health; it highlights the link between opportunities for satisfying work and poor physical and mental health, and it highlights that these make a real difference to the quality of life, length of life and human rights.

One member of staff from a local organisation raised the issue of how local people and young people cope with all the ongoing change and uncertainty involved with regeneration – they saw part of their role as supporting them in that. This too is a health issue. How do people cope if they don't know where they will live next or when they will move? For some, regeneration can feel like an exciting opportunity, for others an unwanted and frightening unknown, particularly if you've lived in the same house for 50 years.

The active people here are making these links and the challenge for any learning programme is to both support other local people in making these connections, and then to consider what the alternatives are. How for instance does the connection between poor health and poverty impact on the local plans for regeneration or national policy? Can thinking about health be used to make a real difference in the everyday lives of people?

---

<sup>36</sup> For more information on the Democracy, Disability and Society Group go on the internet at: [www.ddsg.org.uk/](http://www.ddsg.org.uk/)

## **Regeneration – what is its impact in Craigmillar?**

People had mixed views about what is happening and could happen in the area.

One person reflected that poverty and deprivation is still very much part of the community although the nature of it has changed:

*Poverty, deprivation has changed. Now people have washing machines, fridges, TVs, videos. There are cars and motorbikes in Craigmillar. Are people a lot 'better off'? But if you've got children you will need to buy clothing, food and toys. Also many people are out of work and stand in the queue waiting to collect their giros.*

Some people are positive about the overall idea of regeneration, saw their participation as part of the process of change, and felt they were benefiting from it personally:

*(My volunteering is) part of the regeneration – I've moved to the area, bought a house, and gained from the regeneration*

Likewise one person was similar committed to joining in although wondering what the results would be:

*Being involved makes you feel better about the place. But ... we'll not know what's improved for at least another 3 years.*

One person spoke of the long-running nature of regeneration already and the slowness of change:

*The first year in Craigmillar I was working as a volunteer in McGovern House and community education staff there said in 2 years time people will be running their own affairs. It's taken 15 years for me to get there and find secure employment in community work on an equal footing with other professionals in the field.*

Another person emphasised, both, the already long-term nature of regeneration, and that Craigmillar was providing leadership in this type of community development despite the difficulties the community faces:

*Craigmillar has been a pathfinder for other communities ... the Urban Programme, we've had 7 years of funding leading to mainstreaming. There will be improvements unless it goes topsy-turvy. There's problems in every estate. May be Craigmillar has more problems than others, more deprivation, but through the projects people are gaining in confidence and ready to go further afield. But this is for the long haul.*

However they were sceptical of the commitment of the City Council to working with the community:

*Housing for Craigmillar, I'm cynical, but what we have achieved we can be proud of. The City Council says it will give more housing but this needs dialogue*

This was echoed in the thoughts of another activist:

*Planning officers say they are learning from the successful regeneration project at Crown St, the Gorbals in Glasgow because the Joint Venture Company (PARC) have told them this ... but it's nothing of the sort, it's just concrete ... what are we in favour of? Or is it back to the drawing board? A new school is not going to happen, and it would still be a 'ghetto school'. How much should we compromise on house styles, heights and rented versus private?*

Several people took very different approaches to regeneration. One person felt strongly that the key difficulty for the area was motivating and supporting people to learn. Commitment to education was crucial:

*I don't believe there's such a thing as a deprived area in Britain but I believe in an educational gap ...*

Another had a radical vision of community participation in which local people are put at the centre of the planning process. They see present attempts at regeneration as limited because of the lack of depth of community participation:

*There are those who want to stop it (regeneration) and those who want it to go ahead. If tenant groups want facilities then they could work with development workers on a budget for what is needed, rather than starting out with a budget and dividing the thing up. (see earlier section on social enterprise.)*

And another was sceptical of the value of government led and funded strategies:

*In the 60s people were doing arts and that catalysed them. Put on shows, local political theatres and began to challenge the council. BUT then they got large scale funding through the EEC and the Urban Programme ... and stopped challenging, 'took the King's Shilling'.*

Finally one person, who had recently moved to the area, held conflicting views of whether 'regeneration' could continue to help:

*One way of looking at it is, people are where they are because they want to be. The facilities are here (educational) - the rest is up to people. The people who could make use of regeneration money have done so ... Funding: lots of money being wasted, like aid agencies it all goes on administration.*

*But also I have a conflicting view: For children growing up in Craigmillar, you learn what you see, people not working and minimum wages – it may take imagination to see opportunities.*

*There are people in real need:*

- *(People who have difficulty heating their house) could be helped by the Warmburgh<sup>37</sup> project;*
- *single, young mothers who are poorly educated;*
- *drugs and 'second hand goods' – you hear about people getting arrested.*

**Comment on learning:** Within the community there isn't one immediately accepted view of regeneration; local people don't necessarily agree on the problems or the solutions – although there seems to be a consensus that there is a 'problem'. It would be useful for a learning programme to highlight the different opportunities, possibilities and understandings.

Linked to this is the importance for a learning programme of creating the opportunity for people to share their diversity of views and understandings, and increase the opportunity for them to understand those differences and locate areas of common understandings and concern where they want to learn more together.

There is also the importance of taking a longer term perspective on change; this work has already been going on for a significant period of time within Craigmillar as was seen earlier in this chapter when looking at 'Arts: the Catalyst' and the work of the Craigmillar Festival Society ... and of course in other communities across Scotland and the UK. But is it working?

Dr Chik Collins<sup>38</sup> writing on regeneration and partnership-working writing recently in the Scottish Urban Regeneration Forum's journal points out that:

*'Despite thirty years of effort, achievements of neighbourhood renewal are patchy. While there has been much physical regeneration, and some good examples of communities taking the lead in improving their neighbourhoods, there is little evidence of higher rates of social inclusion for the most disadvantaged households. Indeed, a striking finding is the degree of economic inactivity of households in deprived neighbourhoods, set against an increasing concentration of deprived households in social housing in deprived areas<sup>39</sup>'*

---

<sup>37</sup> Warmburgh is a City Council project aimed at improving energy efficiency in people's homes.

<sup>38</sup> From an Article by Dr. Chik Collins in the Scottish Urban Regeneration Forum (SURF) journal 'Scotregen' – 'Community Regeneration in 'The New Scotland': A Space for Debate? For more information on the Scottish Urban Regeneration Forum go on the internet at: [www.scotregen.co.uk/](http://www.scotregen.co.uk/)

<sup>39</sup> Chik Collins links his comments on the patchiness of regeneration to Professor Michael Carley's report, Community Regeneration and Neighbourhood Renewal: A review of evidence, Communities Scotland, 2002. Available from the Communities Scotland website.

Chik Collins is asking us to consider if, on a larger scale, national policies for regeneration are making a difference. This is a very disconcerting question for people and staff living and working in an area such as Craigmillar that has been involved in so much regeneration over such a long time. Yet there are fundamental questions to continue to ask here about regeneration: Is it working? Is it making enough of a difference? Or is it not doing enough for the people of this community? Surely these are crucial questions for people in this community to have a chance to think about – a clear role for a learning programme.

The other area for a learning programme to consider is to how bring in the knowledge of staff and organisations. For instance, two examples of local knowledge that few living in the community may know about:

- The Craigmillar Social Inclusion Partnership support team spoke of improvements in community safety through the use of CCTV cameras, community policing, community concierges and work between the community and community services.
- The Craigmillar European Programme highlighted the loss in European Regional Development Fund and European Social Fund monies in Scotland by 2006, and that Craigmillar could lose £3-4 million of investment worth about 60 jobs in the near future.

What types of detailed knowledge do local active people need to keep up with? How can community organisations and community services support them in doing this in ways that are lively, interesting and useful, and fit with the time local people have to give to this type of work?

### **Final comment on learning for people who are active in the community**

This chapter has covered a range of learning about Regeneration – from Arts and Culture, Housing, Social Enterprise, and Health – that local active people have discussed with the researcher. It shows the complexity of understanding held within this community that relates to community regeneration:

- ‘festival’ and the arts as central to regeneration
- different approaches to housing
- understanding health and poverty
- community enterprise and economic development
- a willingness to think about whether regeneration is actually working for this community.

This suggests that a learning programme can start to build a successful understanding of what regeneration is or could be about by supporting people in exploring local experiences and stories of regeneration. In these are many of the questions that people are already asking themselves about the types of community regeneration that make sense to them.

However, to this researcher at least, these experiences are pointing outwards towards city wide, national and international policy making, to larger strategies for regeneration, and asking questions about how regeneration of deprived communities can really tackle long-standing poverty. A learning programme needs to create opportunities for people who are active in the community to keep making contact with others who are serious about tackling poverty – whether they be people from other deprived communities, policy makers and politicians, academics and campaigners or economists and business leaders. In effect this is building and sustaining a ‘committed dialogue’, that Jane Thompson<sup>40</sup> proposes (see chapter 1b) about a positive future for this community and others like it.

---

<sup>40</sup> See Chapter 1b pages 12-13 and 17, and also Jane Thompson’s (2001) report, ‘Rerooting lifelong learning: resourcing neighbourhood renewal.’ Details from the National Institute of Adult Continuing Education on the Internet at: <http://www.niace.org.uk/>.